

Interactive comment on “Extracting low frequency climate signal from GRACE data” by O. de Viron et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 4 July 2006

I have the following comments on the paper of O. de Viron et al on Extracting low frequency climate signal from GRACE data.

- 1) the paper is full with spelling and grammar problems that should be fixed
- 2) The GRACE data that was used spans less than three years of data, and this is very short if one intends to extract inter annual ENSO like signals as is claimed by the authors.
- 3) Sentence 2 and 3 on page 23: this is a puzzling statement,
- 4) Sentence 27 page 23, sentence 1 page 24, what is meant by missing data point?
- 5) section 3 on page 24 and page 25 is well known, I recommend to skip it.

6) sentence 9 and 10 on page 26, "In fig 2... SOI" : It may be one ENSO event, but, I don't call this a spectacular result since you should have compared it to several ENSO events. My best guess is that you would need three times the average ENSO period to make such a statement, and this counts to roughly 10 years.

7) Sentence 16+17 page 26, "On the left panel ... " What are you referring to, perhaps figure 4?

8) Figure 4, the caption, which lines refer to the first two EOF time series shown in the upper right panel?

9) Figure 5, caption is rather short and not very informative

Recommendation: I don't think that this paper should be published, at least we should wait for more GRACE data to become available before someone claims to have seen the ENSO cycle in the GRACE dataset.

End of review

Interactive comment on eEarth Discuss., 1, 21, 2006.

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)